Tactics for Managing Supply Uncertainty
Kellogg Operations Workshop, 2006

Brian Tomlin
Kenan-Flagler Business School, UNC
“Multinational companies operating in India must overcome erratic electricity supplies, poor roads, and gridlocked seaports and airports.”
- When to make India a manufacturing base. McKinsey 2005

“Sourcing from China means exposing a company’s supply chain to disruptions that are uncommon in the West.”
- Overcoming the challenges in China operations. BCG 2005

“There are signs that some companies are already alert to these concerns [disruptions] and may be planning to reorganise their supply chains to make them safer.”
- When the chain breaks: being too lean and mean is a dangerous thing. The Economist. 2006
Agenda

- Short life cycle products
  - Diversification
  - Demand management
- Long life cycle products
  - Inventory
  - Contingent supply
  - Risk monitoring
- Conclusions
Diversification: supplier selection

N Suppliers
(Different costs and reliabilities)

Which ones to select?

Cost

Lowest
Active set
Highest

- Two suppliers: Anupindi and Akella (Mgt. Sci, 1993)

- General number of suppliers: Dada, Petruzzi and Schwarz (M&SOM, 2006, forthcoming)

- But not necessarily true if …

  - Demand is discrete: Swaminathan and Shanthikumar (OR Letters 1999)

  - Firm pays for undelivered portion: Tomlin (2005a) [N=2]; Federgruen and Yang (2005) [general N]:

    - Federgruen and Yang (2005): establish indexing should be based on ratio of cost to reliability
Diversification: order sizes

Identical-cost suppliers
“Order sizes are inversely proportional to the ratio of the variance and the mean of the fractional yield”, Agrawal and Nahmias (POMS, 1997)

Non-identical suppliers
More complicated but still driven by supplier “reliability”, Dada, Petruzzi and Schwarz (M&SOM), Federgruen and Yang (2005)

“Cost can be thought of as an order qualifier while reliability can be thought of as an order winner.” Dada, Petruzzi and Schwarz, 2006
Diversification – effect of correlation

- Intuition suggests that correlation should decrease the value of supplier diversification.

- Intuition is sometimes correct.
  - e.g., Tomlin (2005b)

- But not always.
  - Babich et al. (2004)
For identical resources (costs and reliabilities), the flexible structure is preferred to the dedicated structure if (1) resources are perfectly reliable, or (2) the firm is risk neutral. If neither condition holds, then the dedicated structure can be strictly preferred to the flexible structure.

Tomlin and Wang, M&SOM, 2005
Substitution (as a tactic for managing supply failures) is only valuable in the product-diversification structure, and then only if marginal revenue is very high relative to sourcing and substitution costs.

Tomlin (2005b)
Substitution is of value because product supplies negatively correlated.

Price postponement is much more valuable than substitution and gives approximately the same value as completely eliminating supply uncertainty.

Tomlin and Wang (2005)
Long life-cycle products

- Inventory
  - Meyer et al. MS 1979; Bielecki and Kumar OR 1988; Parlar and Berkin NRL 1991; Parlar and Perry EJOR 1995; Gupta INFOR 1996;
  - Moinzadeh and Aggarwal MS 1997; Parlar EJOR 1997; Arreola-Risa and De Croix NRL 1998; Li et al. PEIS 2004; Snyder 2005.

- Two suppliers
  - Parlar and Perry NRL 1996; Gürler and Parlar OR 1997; Tomlin MS 2006
Mitigation and contingent tactics

**Optimal Disruption Strategy**

- **Figure 3** Optimal Disruption-Management Strategies for II-Flexibility Case ($c_f = 1.25c_r$)

**Flexibility of Contingent Supplier**

- Capacity vs. Time
  - Response vs. Time
  - Magnitude
Flexibility profile and disruption type

Longer (and less frequent) disruptions
Volume flexibility a key concern

"More than 50% identified volume flexibility within supply chain management and operations as the key area for improvement." PRTM survey, 2002.
Capacity considerations: recovery time
United Technologies (UTC) uses pattern recognition software to “constantly monitor supplier data” to determine if any of UTC's 18,000 suppliers are heading for trouble … In August 2004 the system generated a financial alert [of a potential bankruptcy] for a key castings supplier … UTC increased its inventory buffer as an added layer of protection.


Tomlin and Snyder (2006)
In conclusion

- Managing supply uncertainty often requires a multi-faceted approach.
  - Inventory, diversification, contingent sourcing, demand management.
  - Distinguishing between intermittent and recurrent supply risks (Chopra et al., 2005).

- Some new research projects I’m working on …
  - Business interruption insurance.
  - Disruptions in supply networks (with Kevin Shang, Duke).

- Many remaining areas for the community to explore, e.g.,
  - Competition, Information, Risk management, Real-time response, Service operations, etc.